

**CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE of the
COLLIER METROPOLITAN PLANNING ORGANIZATION
MEETING MINUTES
November 28, 2022, 2:00 p.m.**

1. Call to Order

Ms. Middelstaedt called the meeting to order at 2:03 p.m.

2. Roll Call

Ms. Siegler called the roll and confirmed a quorum was present.

CAC Members Present

Elaine Middelstaedt, Chair
Dennis DiDonna
Fred Sasser
Josh Rincon (arrived late)
Karen Homiak
Neal Gelfand, Vice-Chair
Rick Hart

CAC Members Absent

Dennis Stalzer
Stephen Spahr

MPO Staff

Anne McLaughlin, Executive Director
Sean Kingston, Principal Planner
Dusty Siegler, Administrative Assistant

Others Present

Alex Showalter, Collier Area Transit
Jacob Stauffer, Collier Area Transit
Lorraine Lantz, Collier County Transportation Planning
Victoria Peters, FDOT
Wally Blain, Benesch

3. **Approval of the Agenda**

Mr. Sasser moved to approve the agenda. Mr. Gelfand seconded. Carried unanimously.

4. **Approval of the September 26, 2022 Meeting Minutes**

Ms. Homiak moved to approve the September 26, 2022 meeting minutes. Mr. Gelfand seconded. Carried unanimously.

5. **Public Comments for Items not on the Agenda**

None.

6. **Agency Updates**

A. FDOT

Ms. Peters stated that the draft tentative work program for FY 2024 through FY 2028 will come out in the next week or so. An online public hearing will take place from December 12, 2022, through December 16, 2022; Ms. Peters can provide the link when it is available. All of the draft tentative work programs will be available online and comments can be submitted online. There will be a hybrid in-person information session/GoTo webinar on Wednesday, December 14, from 9 a.m. to 11 a.m., at FDOT's Southwest Area Urban Office (SWAO). The regional information session that was postponed because of Hurricane Ian has been rescheduled: Wednesday, January 18, 2023, in Bartow, from 9 a.m. to 11:30 a.m. (discretionary grants), and from 1 p.m. to 3 p.m. (Strategic Intermodal System-SIS).

B. MPO Executive Director

Ms. McLaughlin introduced the MPO's new principal planner, Sean Kingston. The MPO has another vacant principal planner position and qualified candidates are encouraged to apply.

7. **Committee Action**

A. Endorse Congestion Management Process (CMP) Origin and Destination (O & D) Report

Ms. McLaughlin stated the O&D Report is the final deliverable for the CMP update for 2022. The Report is intended to inform the MPO about trip-pattern making behavior.

Mr. Blain provided a presentation regarding the final O&D Report. There have been some modifications to the Report since CAC saw the last draft in September.

The analysis in the Report is from the data source Replica. Replica uses location-based service data from mobile phones and data from in-dash navigation, such as commercial vehicles. That information

is balanced with data from the Census Bureau, the American Community Survey and the National Household Travel Survey. All personal information is removed from data gathered and input into a model process to create result patterns. The data gathered is from an average, typical weekday during the Spring (March through May) of 2021. The data source provides updates twice a year (Spring and Fall). **Mr. Sasser** asked if the data takes the number of passengers in a vehicle into account, and **Mr. Blain** responded yes, passenger data is available. **Mr. Sasser** commented that the data is not from the high season timeframe in our area.

Mr. Blain continued his presentation. With respect to the subareas, the planning communities for Collier and Lee County were looked at. There are 17 land use/planning areas in Collier County and Benesch identified additional areas that needed to be defined or expanded. By way of example, the City of Everglades City is a County planning area that does not include Chokoloskee or Plantation Island. The Everglades City subarea was expanded to include the locations for the O&D study. The City of Marco Island was its own County planning area but did not include Goodland or other areas along SR 951. Subareas were not adjusted for Lee County; the 22 subareas from Lee County are as-is. For surrounding counties, no subareas were used.

From a County-wide perspective, daily trips generated were evaluated. There are approximately one million trips daily that start in Collier County and stay in the County. In the Report, trips are counted on a stop-by-stop basis. For example, if a person is going to breakfast, but stops at a gas station on the way, it is counted as two trips instead of one trip. There are approximately 115,000 and 128,000 daily trips respectively either entering or exiting the County. The approximate one million daily trips do not include the trips that pass-through the County. Most trips that pass through the County are on I-75. Many trips that pass through on U.S. 41 west-bound are heading north on SR 29 and SR 82. Some of the pass-through trips on SR 82 are coming from Lee County and then traveling north on SR 29.

Home-to-work trips were also evaluated. Approximately 50% of home-to-work trips have a work destination west of I-75, which is illustrative of the land use pattern of where people work and live. Approximately 10% of the people who reside in Collier County have a work destination in Lee County.

Replica also produces less detailed data weekly. That data was used to determine work-from-home statistics. Trend data for working from home for 2019 through early 2020 was gathered from census data prior to COVID. Subsequently, Replica received trend data regarding people working from home. The work from home information is current through this October and shows a spike in people working from home (or not going to work) in Collier County due to Hurricane Ian. While people are working from home though, there is more flexibility for them to travel during the day.

From a subarea perspective, more details about trip characteristics were evaluated from an origin, destination and home-to-work perspective. The Report includes information on the busiest start time, most common trip purpose, average amount of time for trip durations, and average trip distance. A question that came up previously was about freight. Replica does get data from freight vehicles. There was a previous question about categorization of “errand” and “shopping.” For reporting purposes, shopping is when a good is purchased (*e.g.*, groceries, clothes) and an errand is when a service is purchased (*e.g.*, haircut, oil change, doctor appointment).

Changes that were made since September include: corrections to typos and text inconsistencies; update to the executive summary section (home-to-work detail and work from trends added); clarification added to Table 5 and text for explaining work locations; and revised text describing the number of trips passing through Collier County with an origin and a destination in Lee County. **Mr. Gelfand** asked how many people live in Lee County that come to work in Collier County. **Mr. Blain** responded that, at this time, that was not analyzed in detail. It may be worth looking at in further detail.

Mr. Blain continued that CMC endorsed the Report on November 16. MPO Staff requests that CAC endorse the Report; it will be presented to the MPO Board for their approval at their December 9 meeting. Mr. Blain offered to answer any questions.

Ms. Middelstaedt commented that she is surprised by how few people work in Everglades City that live in that area. **Mr. Sasser** indicated the Report states that as part of the upcoming 2050 LRTP, there would be incorporation of environmental justice areas into the analysis of trip patterns, and asked Mr. Blain to explain what that means. **Mr. Blain** responded that one of the measures the MPO must address under federal transportation legislation, is to look at transportation improvement projects that disproportionately impact areas known as “environmental justice” communities. Those are communities that have an overrepresentation of a minority or low-income population or have otherwise not been engaged in the transportation planning process in the past. In the same way that subareas were evaluated for trip patterns, the defined environmental justice areas can be input into Replica to determine trip characteristics and needs for those communities. **Mr. DiDonna** asked, as it pertains to pass-through trips, who the information in the Report is provided to—the Department of Transportation or planning agencies. **Mr. Blain** responded that the information is used for land use and facility planning. The DOT did a similar analysis in connection with their work on I-75 for interchange points. The information in the Report may be helpful to DOT. **Mr. DiDonna** expressed concern about Collier County ending up with a six-lane highway (like I-95 in the Miami/Fort Lauderdale area), stating if people become too concerned with pass-through traffic, they may demand that I-75 be widened again. **Mr. Blain** emphasized that the pass-through trip graphs are based on traffic volume and not the percentage of the whole. **Mr. DiDonna** wanted to know how many people go through Collier County on the Alligator Alley portion of I-75 that do not stop in Collier County. **Mr. Blain** indicated that on the segment of I-75 going into Lee County, 14% of the daily trips were pass-through trips. For I-75 heading into Broward County, it was nearly 60%. Although the information seems drastically different from a percentage standpoint, it is relatively constant from a total numbers standpoint.

Mr. Sasser moved to endorse Congestion Management Process (CMP) Origin and Destination (O & D) Report. Mr. Rincon seconded. Carried unanimously.

B. Endorse County's Updated Transit Asset Management (TAM) Plan Performance Targets

Ms. McLaughlin stated that, as part of the MPO's performance management reporting, the MPO adopted the TAM Plan performance targets in October of 2018. It has to do with asset management; not adding capacity to the transit system. PTNE oversees the transit for the Collier County area, and they were required to update their TAM Plan this year. The BCC adopted new performance targets and updated the TAM Plan on November 8, 2022. The MPO has sought to maintain consistency with transit asset management performance targets, and it would help maintain consistency with reporting going forward. The updated TAM Plan and performance targets are a refinement and not a change to the current business practice. CAC endorsement is requested; the Technical Advisory Committee (TAC) endorsed at their meeting today. The executive summary to the BCC (attached to the Agenda as Item 7B, Attachment 2) gives good detail on the asset categories, how they are rated, the condition, and what the targets are going forward over the next five years.

Ms. Homiak moved to endorse County's Updated Transit Asset Management (TAM) Plan Performance Targets. Mr. Hart seconded. Carried unanimously.

C. Endorse Transit Regional Service and Fare Study Scope

Ms. McLaughlin explained that the consultant for the study is Jacobs Engineering Group under the County's general planning contract. Jacobs assisted with the MPO's 2045 LRTP. The study is a collaboration between the MPO and PTNE and will evaluate the possibility and feasibility of implementing additional regional bus services between Collier and Lee Counties, including the potential for a regional fare structure. The study will be helpful in the upcoming LRTP update; one of the components of the LRTP is whether regional connections can be expanded. The study is jointly funded by the MPO and PTNE. The Scope is being brought to the MPO Board for approval on December 9. The Scope will then need to be approved by FDOT, FTA and FHWA. Ms. McLaughlin indicated that staff from PTNE was present and can answer any questions. CAC endorsement is requested; TAC endorsed at their meeting today.

Mr. Hart moved to endorse Transit Regional Service and Fare Study Scope. Mr. Rincon seconded. Carried unanimously.

D. Endorse Transfer of \$2.5 million in FY23 SU Funds to CAT Maintenance & Operations Facility Replacement Project

[Mr. Gelfand exited the meeting.]

Ms. McLaughlin indicated that a similar proposal was brought forward approximately one year ago. The Project is the highest priority on the 2022 transit priorities adopted by the MPO Board in June of 2022 and is related to the TAM. SU stands for the Surface Transportation Block Grant (urban funding) and is allocated to the MPO for the MPO Board to program. Under Board policy, funding is rotated through various initiatives (e.g., bicycle/pedestrian, congestion management, bridge, transit, and sometimes safety and the LRTP). The MPO receives approximately \$5 million annually in SU funds, which rotates through the initiatives, giving 100% of the funds accordingly. Occasionally, the MPO receives additional funds in

a given fiscal year that was unable to be programmed to a priority project. Ms. McLaughlin's recollection is that the funds appeared in the SU box after the priorities had already been programmed, and was due to a reconciliation by the federal government after projects were closed. If the funding authority is not used by the MPO, the MPO loses the authority over it. Ms. McLaughlin's understanding is that the money can be transferred (from the FHWA side) to a transit priority project, and different timelines are triggered for transit to be able to utilize the funds. The transfer meets the MPO's goals in terms of prioritizing asset management for transit and to be multi-modal. It would help meet the equity factor because many people who use public transit on a regular basis need the transit to get to work. The transfer is supported by the County as something that can be acted upon. CAC endorsement is requested; TAC endorsed at their meeting today and endorsement is being sought from the MPO Board on December 9.

Mr. Rincon asked if the funds were for maintenance of vehicles or stations. He wanted to be sure that the stations in Immokalee are maintained. **Mr. Showalter** responded that the funds would be going toward the Collier Area Transit (CAT) Maintenance Facility at its Operations Center on Radio Road. **Mr. Rincon** requested that the stations in Immokalee continue to be maintained. **Ms. McLaughlin** indicated that with the transfer of the subject funds, CAT may have more ability to free up funds elsewhere for maintenance.

Mr. Hart moved to Endorse Transfer of up to \$2.5 million in FY23 SU Funds to CAT Maintenance & Operations Facility Replacement Project. Mr. Rincon seconded. Carried unanimously.

8. Reports and Presentation (May Require Committee Action)

None.

9. Member Comments

Mr. Hart commented that his understanding is that Collier County does not want advertisements at bus stops. **Mr. Showalter** confirmed that advertisements are not currently allowed at bus stops. **Mr. Hart** stated that advertisements could help generate funding. He thinks the rule should be looked at again. There are bus stops at many major cities with tactful and non-offensive advertisements. Mr. Hart would like to see the issue back on an agenda. **Ms. McLaughlin** indicated that CAC could request transit planners to provide an explanation of the history of the policy matter. Decisions on transit policy go through the Public Transit Advisory Committee and the BCC. **Mr. Showalter** responded that CAT has started exploring advertising revenue. Currently, proposals for bus wraps are being gathered. It will then be presented to their advisory committee. Advertising at bus stations is also being explored. Part of the original policy was to maintain authority over CAT branding and maintain its identity. **Mr. Rincon** commented that he likes the buses as they are. **Ms. McLaughlin** requested that CAT keep CAC informed as to the status. **Ms. Homiak** commented that it has been a long-standing rule of the County Commissioners to have no advertising at bus stops.

Mr. DiDonna asked if a load factor (occupancy of available seating) chart for the buses would be available at the next meeting. **Ms. McLaughlin** indicated she would request that Michelle Arnold, Director of PTNE, have PTNE staff available at a future CAC meeting to present information. The decision making

for CAT does go through its advisory committee and the BCC. The information is there for everyone to access. The Community Transportation Coordinator's quarterly report that transit provides to the Local Coordinating Board may contain some responsive information. **Mr. DiDonna** indicated he would specifically like to know how many bus seats are being made available and how many are being used. **Ms. McLaughlin** indicated that CAT is exploring different service options to potentially offer. Ms. McLaughlin requested that Mr. Showalter follow up with Ms. Arnold regarding a potential brief presentation and Q&A session, and to have information that is readily available to PTNE.

10. Distribution Items

A. Revised/Final Congestion Hotspots Fact Sheets

Item distributed. **Ms. McLaughlin** indicated the Fact Sheets are part of the CMP update and the O&D Report. The Fact Sheets are in final form and comments on the drafts were addressed.

B. Draft 2023 MPO Meeting Calendar

Item distributed. **Ms. McLaughlin** pointed out that the meeting location for CAC (and TAC) for 2023 has changed. CAC's typical meeting room is no longer available for the MPO to use in 2023. The 2023 meetings will be held next door at the same building where the MPO is located: Transportation Management Services Bldg. Main Conference Room, 2885 S. Horseshoe Dr., Naples, FL, 34104. The front doors of the new meeting location are locked, so the MPO will have someone waiting up front to receive and escort meeting attendees. Members should have Ms. McLaughlin or Mr. Kingston's mobile phone numbers handy in the event they are running late.

11. Next Meeting Date

January 23, 2023, 2:00 p.m. – New location: Transportation Management Services Bldg. Main Conference Room, 2885 S. Horseshoe Dr., Naples, FL, 34104 – in person.

12. Adjournment

Ms. Middelstaedt adjourned the meeting at 3:05 p.m.