

**Collier Metropolitan Planning Organization
Board of County Commission Chambers
Collier County Government Center
3299 Tamiami Trail East, 3rd Floor
Naples, FL 34112
October 14, 2022
9:30 a.m.**

****HYBRID REMOTE – IN-PERSON AND VIRTUALLY VIA ZOOM**

1. CALL TO ORDER

Chair Perry called the meeting to order at approximately 9:34 a.m.

2. ROLL CALL

Ms. Siegler called roll, confirmed a quorum was present in the room, and notified the Board that Council Member Folley and Commissioner Solis were participating remotely.

Commissioner McDaniel moved to allow Council Member Folley and Commissioner Solis to participate remotely. Commissioner Saunders seconded. Passed unanimously.

Members Present (in BCC Chambers)

Council Member Paul Perry, City of Naples, Chair
Commissioner Burt Saunders, Collier County BCC District 3
Commissioner Penny Taylor, Collier County BCC District 4
Commissioner Rick LoCastro, Collier County BCC District 1
Council Member Ted Blankenship, City of Naples
Council Member Tony Pernas, Everglades City
Commissioner William L. McDaniel, Jr., Collier County BCC District 5

Members Present Virtually Via Zoom

Council Member Greg Folley, City of Marco Island, Vice-Chair
Commissioner Andy Solis, Collier County BCC District 2

Members Absent

None

MPO Staff

Anne McLaughlin, Executive Director
Scott Philips, Principal Planner
Dusty Siegler, Administrative Assistant

FDOT

Wayne Gaither, Manager, District 1 Southwest Area Office (SWAO)
Victoria Peters, Community Liaison (arrived late)

Others Present

Brandy Otero, Senior Operations Analyst-Grants, Transportation Management Services Department
Michael Tisch, Collier County Transportation Engineering
Michelle Arnold, Collier County Public Transit Neighborhood Enhancement (arrived late)

Scott Teach, Esq., Deputy County Attorney
Trinity Scott, Department Head, Transportation Management Services Department
Troy Miller, Manager, BCC Television Operations

Zoom Participants

Lorraine Lantz, Collier County Transportation Planning

3. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Chair Perry led the Pledge of Allegiance.

4. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA, PREVIOUS MINUTES AND CONSENT ITEMS

4.A. September 9, 2022 Meeting Minutes

Commissioner McDaniel moved to approve the Agenda and Previous Minutes and Council Member Pernas seconded. Passed unanimously.

5. PUBLIC COMMENTS FOR ITEMS NOT ON THE AGENDA

None.

6. AGENCY UPDATES

6.A. FDOT

Mr. Gaither indicated Victoria Peters was on her way to the meeting. **Mr. Gaither** provided the following updates on the impacts of Hurricane Ian on District 1: there was much damage by wind and storm surge. FDOT has been working diligently within Collier, Lee, Charlotte, and even as far north as Sarasota, Counties doing debris pickup. There was tremendous damage to traffic signal systems; FDOT has mobilized the department and has 200 plus personnel working on debris cleanup, pickup, and the traffic signal systems in the coastal areas and accessing the damage. Beyond traditional hurricane damage, there has been post-storm water damage to some of the inland counties in District 1. Flooding damaged many roads, such as SR 70, 64, 72 and 17; in some areas, roads were impassable because of the water. As the water started to recede, significant damage was revealed. There was a wash-out of some of the smaller bridges in the area and significant damage to the sub-base in some areas, which will require significant effort and time to repair. In addition, there were other significant impacts: Sanibel Causeway, Matlacha Bridge, and several other bridges in the area became impassable. Over the past week and a half, FDOT has assessed damage and has gotten Matlacha Bridge back open so that residents can use it and restoration work has begun. On Sanibel Causeway, the causeway essentially had to be rebuilt. The existing right-of-way and bridge configuration were used, and temporary fixes implemented. FDOT hopes to have transportation to Sanibel back open on the 21st. FDOT was successful in getting the causeway addressed to the point that a first run of emergency vehicles and services could get out to the causeway and drop off materials that were needed. Right now, Sanibel is having to barge over equipment. All that has been done so far is exemplary of the communication with FDOT's partners and communities within District 1 working together to identify problems, gathering information and disseminating information (even with communications

systems down). Disseminating information to the work crews was difficult; there was significant coordination and cooperative efforts.

Mr. Gaither thanked Trinity Scott, Kari Hodgson and Rob Lee. FDOT was working with them on debris management. The landfill in the area had to be utilized and they were extremely helpful in addressing needs to make sure FDOT had a place to put the debris that was cleaned up.

Mr. Gaither offered to answer any questions about FDOT's efforts in District 1 related to Hurricane Ian. **Commissioner Taylor** stated that at a sixteen-county coalition meeting a few weeks ago, a concern was expressed by a representative from Okeechobee that SR 72 was dangerous anyway and maybe the road can be widened because of the hurricane evacuation. Then, testimony came forward that many people use SR 72. **Commissioner Taylor** asked Mr. Gaither if the road is impassable and the status of the road. **Mr. Gaither** responded his understanding, as of a few days ago, is that all of our roads are operational; FDOT is finding issues, such as minor sinkholes and washouts, and those are being addressed as quickly as possible. Both the immediate needs and long-term concerns that come up are being addressed. In some areas, such as 64, the water main underneath had some issues and was causing washouts and dipping in the asphalt. Temporary fixes are in place; permanent fixes are in the works.

Ms. Peters informed everyone that FDOT's planned discretionary grant workshops in Fort Myers and Bartow were cancelled due to Hurricane Ian and the ongoing responses thereto. The workshops will be rescheduled, and Ms. Peters will advise when they are. **Ms. Peters** commended Connie Dean and the Emergency Operations Center in handling questions about the Jolley Bridge and Marco Island; it has been great working with Collier County. FDOT wants to help and wants to be part of the community.

6.B. MPO EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

Ms. McLaughlin indicated she had an announcement and requested Brandy Otero come to the floor. Ms. Otero accepted another position with Collier County Transportation Services Management Department overseeing multiple grants. Ms. Otero still works close to the MPO and the MPO still has her guidance. **Ms. McLaughlin** thanked Ms. Otero for an extraordinary six years working together; Ms. Otero has been with the MPO for eleven years overall.

[The Board Members applauded Ms. Otero.] **Ms. Otero** thanked Ms. McLaughlin and the Board. **Ms. Otero** explained that she started with the MPO as a planning technician and worked her way up to a principal planner. Everything she learned at the MPO allowed her to grow to become a grants supervisor. She will be involved in overseeing the MPO's grants. She has enjoyed working with Ms. McLaughlin and Ms. McLaughlin has been one of the best supervisors she has ever had. She will miss the MPO, the MPO Board, and getting to work closely with elected officials. **Chair Perry** inquired about having a photo taken of Ms. Otero, Ms. McLaughlin and the Board. [A group photo of the Board, Ms. Otero and Ms. McLaughlin was taken.]

7. COMMITTEE CHAIR REPORTS

7.A. CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE (CAC)

7.A.1. Citizens Advisory Committee Chair Report

Ms. McLaughlin indicated the Chair was not present; the report is in the agenda packet.

7.B. TECHNICAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE (TAC)

7.B.1. Technical Advisory Committee Chair Report

Ms. McLaughlin indicated the Chair, Lorraine Lantz, was present virtually via Zoom to answer any questions. The report is in the agenda packet.

7.C. BICYCLE PEDESTRIAN ADVISORY COMMITTEE (BPAC)

7.C.1. Bicycle and Pedestrian Advisory Committee Chair Report

Ms. McLaughlin indicated the Chair, Anthony Matonti, is out of town and will provide an update at the next MPO Board meeting.

7.D. CONGESTION MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE (CMC)

7.D.1. Congestion Management Committee Chair Report

Ms. McLaughlin indicated the Chair was not present; the report is in the agenda packet.

7.E. LOCAL COORDINATING BOARD (LCB)

7.E.1. Local Coordinating Board Chair Report

Ms. McLaughlin indicated that Staff defers to the report in the agenda packet.

8. REGULAR BOARD ACTION (ROLL CALL REQUIRED)

None.

9. REGULAR BOARD ACTION (NO ROLL CALL)

9.A. Approval of Annual Performance Review of MPO Executive Director

Ms. McLaughlin stated that Items 9.A., 9.B., and 9.C., are somewhat related because they have to do with the performance evaluation for next year. Ms. McLaughlin's Employment Agreement requires her to submit an annual evaluation according to a plan the Board adopted last year. As the date of publication of the agenda packet, Ms. McLaughlin had evaluation forms from six Board Members in the form of responses to a survey. Another response has since come in. The scores were in the 2 and 3 range; the top

score is 3. There were some very positive comments made, which she appreciates. Ms. McLaughlin has enjoyed working with this Board. The MPO Staff strives to do its best for the MPO Board.

Commissioner Taylor commented that when Ms. McLaughlin first came to the MPO, it was in a state of disarray. The MPO Board, Ms. McLaughlin and Ms. Otero have worked together and there has been progress ever since. **Commissioner Taylor** thanked Ms. McLaughlin and Ms. Otero.

Commissioner Saunders moved to approve the annual performance review of MPO Executive Director and Commissioner McDaniel seconded. Passed unanimously.

9.B. Approve Strategic Plan for Federal Fiscal Year (FFY) 2023

Ms. McLaughlin explained that she has submitted a proposed Strategic Plan that carries forward focus areas that have been in place since approximately 2016. Over time, the emphasis changes slightly as needs change. Staff returned to a format previously used in 2016 to ensure more detail is provided. The Plan is a draft until approved by the Board. The Plan proposes three major results-oriented goals: effective and efficient use of resources; upholding constructive relationships with planning partners; and new this year, new funding opportunities (added because there is much to understand and take advantage of under the new Bipartisan Infrastructure Law). Addressing Staff vacancies was also added.

Ms. McLaughlin informed the Board that Mr. Scott Philips has accepted a position with the State Legislature in Tallahassee and will be leaving the MPO at the end of October. **Ms. McLaughlin** expressed that she is very happy for Ms. Otero and Mr. Philips. The MPO does have a new principal planner starting at the end of October; someone from the Growth Management Department.

Commissioner Taylor moved to approve the Strategic Plan for FFY 2023 and Commissioner LoCastro seconded. Passed unanimously.

9.C. Approval of MPO Director's Annual Performance Evaluation Plan for FFY 2023

Ms. McLaughlin explained the changes to the Annual Performance Evaluation Plan for FFY 2023 track the changes made to the Strategic Plan. Only the first three items under Part One have changed. Staff requests the Board's approval to be consistent with the Strategic Plan.

Commissioner Taylor moved to approve the Annual Performance Evaluation Plan for FFY 2023 and Commissioner Saunders seconded. Passed unanimously.

9.D. Appointment of Local Coordinating Board Chairperson

Ms. McLaughlin explained that a new Chair of the LCB needs to be appointed because Commissioner Solis is the current Chair, and he has decided not to run for office again. The LCB is meeting in December, which is why Staff included the appointment on the agenda for today's meeting. Rule 41 (Attachment 9.D.1 to the agenda) provides that an elected official is to be appointed to serve as the official chairperson: "the appointed person shall be an elected official from the county that the Coordinating Board serves." **Chair Perry** asked if the Chair can be any elected official, or if it needs to be an elected official

on the Board. **Ms. McLaughlin** responded that the County is inclusive of the incorporated cities. **Chair Perry** asked for clarification of whether the elected official to be appointed must be an elected official on the MPO Board or if it can be an elected official not serving on the MPO Board. **Chair Perry** requested Mr. Teach to come to the floor. **Mr. Teach** stated that he looked at this issue several years ago, and looked at various MPOs throughout the State, and generally, it can be any elected official on the MPO Board. Looking at other jurisdictions, the chairperson was always someone from that body. Mr. Teach found no regulations providing that someone outside of the body could act as chairperson. Mr. Teach is not sure that it cannot be done, but the general rule he has observed is that the LCB chairperson is someone from the MPO Board.

Chair Perry asked if any Members were interested in serving as Chair of the LCB. **Council Member Pernas** expressed interest in serving as Chair of LCB. **Commissioner Saunders** asked how often LCB meets, and **Ms. McLaughlin** responded LCB meets quarterly. LCB could rely on the Vice-Chair for the upcoming December meeting, if necessary, and bring the item back before the Board in February when there are two more commissioners, if that is the Board's preference. The LCB meets at 1:30 p.m., on March 1, 2023, May 3, 2023, September 6, 2023, and December 6, 2023. **Ms. Siegler** stated the location of the LCB meetings will be in the same building as BCC Chambers, but in the IT Training Room on the fifth floor. **Council Member Pernas** indicated he would serve as Chair if the LCB meetings are quarterly.

Council Member Pernas moved to appoint Council Member Pernas as Chair of LCB and Council Member Blankenship seconded. Passed unanimously.

9.E. Reappointment of a Member to the Local Coordinating Board

Ms. McLaughlin requested the Board reappoint Dylan Vogel for another three-year term on the LCB. His current term expires in December of this year.

Commissioner McDaniel moved to approve reappointment of Dylan Vogel to the LCB and Commissioner Taylor seconded. Passed unanimously.

9.F. Appointment of a Member to the Local Coordinating Board

Ms. McLaughlin requested the Board appoint Rick Hart to the LCB. Mr. Hart has been serving on CAC in the capacity as a representative of the disabled population; he has been diligent and has a good attendance record.

Commissioner McDaniel moved to approve the appointment of Rick Hart to the LCB and Council Member Pernas seconded. Passed unanimously.

9.G. Approve Amendment #2 to FY 22/23-23/24 Unified Planning Work Program (UPWP)

Ms. McLaughlin requested the Board approve the proposed Amendment; it is a net zero amendment in that it does not change the bottom line of the MPO's budget. The Amendment moves funding from personnel to consultant services in Tasks 1, 2, 3, and 5, to provide general support to the MPO. Ms. McLaughlin stated the Amendment is a backup plan and safety net. She intends to re-post the principal planner position, but recruiting staff is difficult at this time and has proven to be difficult for the MPO over the past few years. The MPO has deadlines that must be met with no exceptions. The Amendment would allow Ms. McLaughlin to hire a consultant, if necessary, to augment staff. If it is not needed, the Board will be provided with another amendment as some point in the future. **Chair Perry** asked for confirmation that the Amendment is just to move funds from personnel to an outside consultant, if needed, and **Ms. McLaughlin** confirmed. **Chair Perry** commented that the MPO will be two staff members short. Is the Amendment necessary because Ms. McLaughlin would be in the position of doing three jobs? **Ms. McLaughlin** responded in the affirmative and pointed out that there are also training needs when someone new is hired. Ms. McLaughlin needs to be able to call on experienced staff, if necessary. There is support the MPO can draw upon from member organizations to assist, but Ms. McLaughlin cannot lean heavily on staff who are already filling many roles in their own agencies.

Commissioner McDaniel moved to approve Amendment #2 to FY 22/23-23/24 Unified Planning Work Program and Commissioner Taylor seconded. Passed unanimously.

9.H. Approve the Addition of Funds to Cover Cost Increases on Eden Park Elementary and 111th Ave. N Projects

Ms. McLaughlin requested the Board approve the addition of funds to cover cost increases on Eden Park Elementary and 111th Avenue North projects. The projects are County projects oriented toward bicycle/pedestrian improvements. The requirement for urbanized area funds (SU funds) is that a construction estimate be done at the time of application. The construction estimate for the 111th Avenue North paved shoulder project (to expand the paved shoulders to be more accessible to bicyclists) was developed in 2013. The construction estimate for the Eden Park Elementary Safe Routes to School sidewalk project was developed in 2016. There has been a significant escalation in costs. FDOT has advised the MPO to keep a larger cushion than normal in its SU box to be able to cover cost overruns. This situation is not exceptional; many city and county projects will likely have the same issue. The County has worked within its budget system to find funds to cover some of the costs that have increased, including construction engineering and inspection costs. The request is for an additional \$125,000 for the 111th Avenue North project, and just under \$800,000 for the Eden Park Elementary project. With FDOT's help, the MPO has evaluated its SU box; according to the last printout of the Work Program on September 15, 2022, there is a balance of \$3.3 million. There is an additional approximate \$519,000 in transportation alternative funds, which are often used for bicycle/pedestrian projects. Sufficient funding is available to cover the requests. The MPO and FDOT are still looking for budget authority to make a transaction work, which is why Staff has not provided a specific spreadsheet for the Board's consideration yet. Staff is hopeful to have the Board's support for adding funds to the two projects.

Chair Perry asked if the two projects are moving forward into construction soon. **Ms. McLaughlin** responded yes; Michael Tisch, County project manager for both projects, and Victoria Peters, were present to answer any questions. It is intended that the projects move into the construction phase.

***Council Member Pernas** moved to approve the addition of funds to cover cost increases on Eden Park Elementary and 111th Avenue North projects and **Commissioner Taylor** seconded. Passed unanimously.*

10. PRESENTATIONS (MAY REQUIRE BOARD ACTION)

10.A. Federal Fiscal Year (FFY) 2022 Annual Report

Ms. McLaughlin provided a presentation on highlights from the Annual Report:

The purpose of the Annual Report is two-fold. First, to tell the MPO's story, which is for the general public and people new to the area. It is the who, what, why, defining characteristics relative to transportation planning and infrastructure. Second, to report on performance - strategic, local plan implementation and national measures. On the MPO budget and operations, looking at FY 2023 and 2024 together, there is a fairly even split between personnel and professional services. Other operating expenses are around 7%. There will be some fluctuation to professional services as the update to the Long-Range Transportation Plan gets underway. The revenue of approximately \$2.5 million for the two years is expected to be on-hand, and some of it is rollover from previous years. There are various ways to analyze the Transportation Improvement Program (TIP). Ms. McLaughlin has started doing an equity analysis of the FY 2023-2027 TIP; in some instances, projects are a direct benefit to low-income, traditionally underserved communities, such as safety projects and bicycle/pedestrian projects. There are other projects that are in the Capacity section of the TIP that are intended to reduce congestion and make it easier to travel to work and services. The equity assessment is 96%, which is good. The federal government has been recently using different ways of analyzing this, and Ms. McLaughlin will keep the Board up to date on any requirements or what the federal government would like to see on grant applications.

Ms. McLaughlin shared a map of Environmental Justice area that was created in connection with the Bicycle/Pedestrian Master Plan in 2019. It is being updated now. There appears to be little change from the 2019 map and the map that was updated based on 2020 census information. There have been changes, though, in how the federal government wants the analysis completed.

On strategic plan measures, as it relates to public outreach, Ms. McLaughlin has committed to do a few surveys each year. One is to the MPO's Adviser Network (approximately 400 people). Their concerns regarding transportation are evenly distributed amongst bicycle/pedestrian, congestion, safety, capacity, and environmental impact. The MPO also included a general survey question on social media in an effort to reach people about what the MPO is. The response focused more strongly on congestion. Quite a few of the social media participants did not know what the MPO is or what it does. The MPO follows up by providing informational materials. The MPO also reports on local plan implementation performance measures. When the Board adopts a plan or approves a study, there are generally performance measures in them, and the reporting is generally included in the Annual Report. New items that will be included in the Annual Report for next year are the Congestion Management Process (April, 2022) and Origin &

Destination Study (expected December, 2022). With respect to national performance measures, we are generally doing well. Neither FDOT nor the MPO is meeting the zero target for fatalities and serious injuries. Importantly, it continues to be a focus for investment.

In terms of transit facilities, the MPO has demonstrated willingness to support investment in transit. With respect to safety trends, it is difficult to draw conclusions around trends because there is typically fluctuation with economic development and growth. Looking at rates is one way to equalize things over time because a rate is per population or per vehicle miles travelled. So, a community could continue to grow, but the rate could go up or down depending on a host of other factors. Annual average fatality rates were high from 2009 through 2013. They dipped, as often happens with an economic slump, and started coming back up in 2019 (but are still lower than they were). Average annual serious injury rates are climbing back up, but not as high as 2009 through 2013. Of concern is that the average annual ped and bike fatalities and serious injuries are climbing higher.

Moving forward, Federal fund apportionments have increased. Ms. McLaughlin’s understanding is, apart from planning funds, FDOT is still awaiting budget authority from the State legislature. Overall, it is hopeful to have an increase of \$1.5 million available for projects. Staff applied for the Safe Streets and Roads for All grant. Ms. McLaughlin has shared some of the other discretionary grant programs under the Bipartisan Infrastructure Law with local governments.

Council Member Folley expressed concern regarding the use of the term “environmental justice.”

Chair Perry asked if the Board’s approval of the Annual Report was required. **Ms. McLaughlin** responded she has not asked the Board to approve the Annual Report in the past, but if the Board would like to start, Staff can include it as an action item next time. **Chair Perry** indicated there is likely no need to unless the other Board Members felt there was a need to. The Board could simply accept the Report. **Ms. McLaughlin** indicated she would use the term “accepted” next year. **Chair Perry** stated if there were no objections, the Annual Report would be accepted as presented. There were no objections.

11. DISTRIBUTION ITEMS

11.A. Revised 2022 MPO Meeting Schedule

Ms. McLaughlin indicated the Revised 2022 MPO Meeting Schedule reflects that the joint meetings scheduled with Lee MPO have been cancelled because the hurricane recovery efforts demand so much of everyone, especially local governments. Staff conferred with Lee MPO’s director and together decided it would be best to cancel the meetings and allow local government to focus on recovery. **Chair Perry** pointed out that there would be no meeting in November. **Ms. McLaughlin** responded that no regular meeting of the Board had been set for November because it would have fallen on Veterans Day; Ms. McLaughlin does not see a need to hold a meeting in November. All the action items that Staff are aware of have already been covered. The next meeting will be in December.

11.B. Draft 2023 MPO Meeting Schedule

Ms. McLaughlin indicated she wanted to provide the draft 2023 MPO Meeting Schedule so that the Board and others can notify Staff if there is concern. Staff intends to bring the draft to the Board in December for approval. The draft in the agenda packet did have a few errors. The MPO Board will continue to meet at 9:30 a.m. (not 9 a.m.). There is a correction on a meeting room and some of the meeting rooms have changed this year. Tentative joint meetings with Lee County have been slated, but they still need to be cleared with Lee MPO; the dates are similar to the dates for joint meetings this year. **Chair Perry** pointed out that there is no Board meeting in January, so between now and February, there is only the December meeting.

12. MEMBER COMMENTS

Commissioner Taylor wished everyone a happy Thanksgiving holiday and encouraged everyone to reach out to their neighbors, especially those who endured damage from Hurricane Ian; reaching out can make a world of difference.

Commissioner Saunders indicated this may be the last Board meeting for Commissioner Taylor and Commissioner Solis. Commissioner Saunders thanked them for their dedication and service over the years.

Council Member Folley gave his regards and thanks to Commissioner Taylor and Commissioner Solis. Council Member Folley thanked everyone for their help in getting the County and the State back up after Hurricane Ian.

Commissioner McDaniel stated his only comment was to repeat the comments of the Members before him.

Council Member Blankenship thanked the County staff and the teams helping in the City of Naples, where there was substantial damage; the City really appreciates the support.

Commissioner Solis thanked everyone and stated it has been his honor and privilege to serve on the MPO Board. Commissioner Solis thanked staff for their unending commitment to getting the community back on its feet after another natural disaster.

Chair Perry agreed with the Members' comments related to Commissioner Taylor and Commissioner Solis and expressed it has been a pleasure working with them. Chair Perry thanked the MPO Staff that are leaving for their hard work. Lastly, in the wake of Hurricane Ian, the coordination of the debris removal in the City has been phenomenal. Although some residents feel their debris should have been picked up already, the rate at which it is being removed is amazing.

13. NEXT MEETING DATE

13.A. Next Meeting Date - December 9, 2022 - 9:30 a.m. Board of County Commissioners Chambers, 3299 Tamiami Trail East, Naples, FL, 34112

14. ADJOURN

*There being no further business, **Chair Perry** adjourned the meeting at approximately 10:31 a.m.*