

**COLLIER METROPOLITAN PLANNING ORGANIZATION (MPO) BOARD MEETING  
MINUTES  
Board of County Commissioners Chambers  
3299 E. Tamiami Trail, Naples  
9:00 a.m. May 11, 2018**

**1. Call to Order**

**Commissioner McDaniel** called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m.

**2. Roll Call**

**Ms. Otero** called the roll and confirmed a quorum was present.

**Members Present**

Chair Commissioner William L. McDaniel, Jr., Collier County BCC District 5; Commissioner Penny Taylor, Collier County BCC District 4; Vice-Chair Commissioner Andy Solis, Collier County BCC District 2; Councilwoman Linda Penniman, City of Naples; Councilman Reg Buxton, City of Naples; Commissioner, Burt Saunders, Collier County BCC District 3; Councilman Joe Batte, City of Marco Island; Councilwoman Elaine Middelstaedt, City of Everglades City.

**Members Absent:** Commissioner Donna Fiala, Collier County BCC District 1.

**Staff:** Anne McLaughlin, MPO Executive Director; Brandy Otero, MPO Senior Planner; Eric Ortman, MPO Senior Planner;

**Others Present:** Scott Teach, Deputy County Attorney; Trinity Scott, Collier County Transportation Planning; Lorraine Lantz, Collier County Transportation Planning; Wally Blain, Tindale Oliver Associates; Randy Farwell, Tindale Oliver Associates; Katie Habgood, Jacobs Engineering; Victoria Peters, FDOT; Michelle Arnold, Director, Public Transportation and Neighborhood Enhancement; LK Nandam, FDOT; Thaddeus Cohen, Department Head, Growth Management Department; Garrett Beyrent, Citizen; Gary Shirk, CAC Chair; Joseph Bonness, BPAC Chair; Rae Ann Burton, Citizen; Robert Anderson, Citizen; Nicole Johnson, Conservancy of Southwest Florida; Patricia Huff, Citizen; Fred Thomas, Citizen; Charlotte Nycklemoe, League of Women Voters; Pat Utter, Collier Enterprises

**3. Pledge of Allegiance**

**Chairman McDaniel** led the Pledge of Allegiance.

**4. Approval of the Agenda, Previous Minutes, and Consent Items**

**4A April 13, 2018 MPO Board Meeting Minutes**

*Commissioner Solis moved to approve the minutes of the April 13, 2018 meeting subject to revising Rae Ann Burton's petition submittal to 36 signatures. Second by Councilman Batte. Carried unanimously 8 – 0.*

**4.B Reappointment of Victor Ordija to the Bicycle Pedestrian Advisory Committee (BPAC)**

Executive Summary *“Reappointment of Victor Ordija to the Bicycle Pedestrian Advisory Committee (BPAC),”*

**4.C Appointment of a new CAC member**

Executive Summary *“Appointment of a new CAC member.”*

*Commissioner Solis moved to approve the Agenda subject to hearing Item 9.C before Item 8.A, addition of Item 5.a Volunteer Recognitions. Said motion to include approving of Items 4.B and 4.C listed in the Consent Agenda. Second by Councilman Buxton. Carried unanimously 8 – 0.*

## **5. Public Comments for Items Not on the Agenda**

Garrett Beyrent provided a handout regarding a Tourist Development Project.

### **5.A Volunteer Recognitions**

The Members recognized Patricia Huff and Fred Thomas for their service to the County.

## **6. Agency Updates**

### **A. FDOT**

**Ms. Peters, FDOT** reported the State Road 29 Immokalee Project Development and Environmental (PD&E) study continues including identifying funding sources. The study will be coordinated with the MPO and the BCC.

### **B. MPO Executive Director**

**Ms. McLaughlin** reported:

- Gabrielle Gonzalez, MPO Administrative Secretary left the Organization for a new position in the County.
- Bill Moss, Naples City Manager provided a letter to Staff on the City's position on the FDOT's Traffic Management Center Co-location Feasibility Study – *Chairman McDaniel reported the item will be addressed under Item 12.*

## **7. Committee Chair Reports**

### **7.A Citizens Advisory Committee (CAC)**

Staff provided the Executive Summary "*Citizens Advisory Committee Chair Report*" for information purposes.

#### **7.A.1 Citizen Advisory Committee Chair Report**

**Gary Shirk** reported a meeting was held on 4/30/2018 where the Committee:

- Reviewed the update on Golden Gate Community Walkability Study.
- Reviewed the CAT Fare Study.
- Endorsed the proposed amendments to the 2040 Long Range Transportation Plan.
- Endorsed the FY18/19–FY19/20 Unified Planning Work Program (UPWP).
- Endorsed the 2018 Project Priorities.

### **7.B Technical Advisory Committee (TAC)**

Staff provided the Executive Summary "*Technical Advisory Committee Chair Report*" for information purposes.

#### **7.B.1 Technical Advisory Committee Chair Report**

**Ms. McLaughlin** reported a meeting was held on 4/30/2018 where the Committee endorsed:

- The proposed amendments to the 2040 Long Range Transportation Plan.
- The FY18/19–FY19/20 Unified Planning Work Program (UPWP).

- The 2018 Project Priorities with the exception of Congestion Management requesting further assessment of project status by the Congestion Management Committee and reporting back to the TAC.
- The CAT Fare Study.

**7.C Bicycle and Pedestrian Advisory Committee (BPAC)**

Staff provided the Executive Summary “*BPAC Committee Chair Report Bicycle and Pedestrian Advisory Committee*” for information purposes.

**7.C.1 Bicycle and Pedestrian Advisory Committee (BPAC) Chair Report**

**Joseph Bonness** reported the Committee met on 4/17/2018 and noted:

- The FDOT resurfacing project on Collier Boulevard between the Judge Jolly Bridge and Fiddler’s Creek would include six-foot buffered bike lanes on both sides of the road as part of the Department’s Complete Streets efforts.
- Smart Growth America had listed the FDOT’s Design Manual as one of the twelve best complete street initiatives in the country in 2017.
- The Committee received an update on the Bicycle & Pedestrian Master Plan.
- The Committee heard presentations on the Golden Gate City Walkable Community Study and the Amendment to the 2040 Long Range Transportation Plan.
- The 2018 Bicycle and Pedestrian Priorities were distributed to the Committee.
- The Committee endorsed the FY2019–FY2023 Transportation Improvement Program (TIP).
- The May BPAC meeting is being combined with a stakeholder group meeting for the Bicycle & Pedestrian Master Plan and will be held on May 21st at 10:30 a.m.

**7.D Local Coordinating Board**

Staff provided the Executive Summary “*Local Coordinating Board Chair Report*” for information purposes.

**7.D.1 Local Coordinating Board Chair Report**

**Ms. Otero** reported there was no quorum for the 5/2/18 meeting and it has been rescheduled to 5/23/18.

**9. Regular Board Action (No Roll Call) - this item was heard before Item 8**

**9.C Review and Endorse the Collier Area Transit (CAT) Fare Study and Recommendations**

Staff presented the Executive Summary “*Review and Endorse the Collier Area Transit (CAT) Fare Study and Recommendations*” for consideration.

**Randy Farwell, Tindale Oliver** presented the PowerPoint “*CAT Fare Study Executive Summary March 2018 Draft 2018*” highlighting:

- The study analyzed the fixed route and paratransit fare to identify fare policy recommendations and assessed potential ridership and revenue impacts with a goal of minimizing adverse impacts on low income and minority persons as required by the Federal Transit Administration (FTA) - Title VI.
- In addition to data analysis, a public outreach campaign was undertaken to help formulate the recommendations.
- Generally, a majority of users supported fare increases if the additional revenue yielded increased levels of service.
- The recommendations for fixed route include:
  - Full Fixed Route Fare \$1.50/\$0.75 to **\$2.00/\$1.00**

- Transfer Full/Reduced \$0.75/\$0.35 to **Free 90 min**
  - Children Age 5 & Under Free Age 5 & Under Free
  - Day Pass Full/Reduced \$4.00/\$2.00 to **\$3.00/\$1.50**
  - 7-Day Pass Full/Reduced \$15.00/\$7.50 **N/A**
  - 15-Day Pass Full/Reduced - (new) N/A to **\$20.00/\$10.00**
  - 30-Day Pass Full/Reduced \$35.00/\$17.50 to **\$40.00/\$20.00**
  - Marco Express Single Fare Full/Reduced \$2.50/\$1.20 to **\$3.00/\$1.50**
- The recommendations for the paratransit service include:
    - No fare change to ADA or for lowest-income TD fares (paying \$1, \$3, or \$4).
    - Reduce income-based TD fare categories to streamline collection and administration (riders now paying \$5 and \$7 will pay \$4).
    - Postponing any ADA fare increase within next two years to provide time to monitor ridership and revenue
    - Explore the feasibility of an unlimited paratransit pass and/or reduced cost trip.
  - Other general recommendations include:
    - Exploring increased sale of passes at third party vendors and use of smartphone applications to be used as passes/fares options.
    - Include college-age students and active/retired military personnel as reduced-fare eligible for fixed-route (with valid ID).
    - Incentivize Business Pass Program by maintaining a corporate 30-day pass rate of \$29.75 if regular 30-day pass price increases to \$40.
    - Implement a free transit day to attract infrequent or new riders.

The recommendations will be presented to the Board of County Commissioners on June 12<sup>th</sup> who must approve via resolution for the fare changes to be adopted.

Under Board discussion, the following was noted:

- The methodology used in determining the recommended fares included measuring the elasticity of fares and other model combinations.
- The goal for CAT is to provide equitable fares as public transportation operations (versus capital projects) in general do not “break even” given the nature of the service provided to the public.
- The consultant analyzed a variety of scenarios for the fare structure and various advisory boards including the Technical Advisory Committee provided input on the study.
- The public outreach occurred via surveys, comments at public meetings, onsite interviews with riders at the transfer stations, etc.
- The beach trolley is a free service provided by the program and was not a subject of the study.
- The cost per rider is \$5.00 for the fixed route and \$34.00 for the paratransit user.
- Funding sources include the General Fund, grants and user fees with a goal to narrow the gap between user fees and the money required from the General Fund.
- Investigation occurs to determine if employers who benefit from express services may potentially provide some assistance to the program.

*Councilwoman Penniman moved to approve the Fare Study and associated recommendations. Second by Councilman Batte. Carried unanimously 8 – 0.*

## **8. Regular Board Action (Roll Call Required)**

### **8.A Approve the Proposed 2040 Long Range Transportation Plan (LRTP) Amendment Executive Summary**

**Ms. Otero** presented the Executive Summary “*Approve the Proposed 2040 Long Range Transportation Plan (LRTP) Amendment*” for consideration.

**Mr. Blain** presented the PowerPoint “*Collier MPO 2040 Long Range Transportation Plan Amendment – May 11, 2018*” highlighting:

- The purpose of the amendment is to incorporate impacts for the proposed Rural Lands West (RLW) development, update to the 2040 LRTP socioeconomic land use data, list of corridor needs and list of cost feasible projects including future growth reallocations.
- The amendment identifies the following Needs Networks pending BOCC recommendations on the Randall Blvd./Oil Well Road Corridor Study.
  - Alternative 2a – Randall / S-Curve / Oil Well (6 lane corridor)
  - Alternative 3a – Randall Extension / Oil Well (6 lane corridor)
  - Big Cypress Parkway 2 lanes
  - Vanderbilt Beach Road and Golden Gate Blvd extended to Big Cypress Parkway.
- The proposed amendment also identifies costs for the various needs with alternatives identified for Randall Blvd. (Alternative 2a – Randall / S-Curve / Oil Well - 6 lane corridor - \$2.469 billion and Alternative 3a – Randall Extension / Oil Well - 6 lane corridor - \$2.467 billion totals).
- The prioritization scoring was based on the same criteria from the LRTP 2015 Working Group (System Connectivity, Evacuation Route, Reduce Congestion, Wetland Impact, Species Impact, Freight Route).
- The Randall Blvd. widening and connection from 8th Street to Oil Well Road/Everglades (S-Curve) and Vanderbilt Beach Extension from 8th to Desoto (2 lanes within 4 lanes ROW) were removed from 2015 adopted plan and proposed to be added back into the plan.
- The activity included convening public meetings, acquiring written comments which yielded a concern regarding alignment of Vanderbilt Beach Road Extension and opposition to S-Curve Alignment in Randall/Oil Well Corridor Study, questions on Impact Fees and required developer payments, concern for wildlife and species habitat impacts, etc.
- The Technical Advisory Committee and Citizens Advisory Committee endorsed the proposed amendments.

Under Board discussion,

- Concern the amendments may be premature given the initiatives address development projects not yet approved without the funding sources identified - *Staff noted the collection of impact fee revenue is projected through 2040 and incorporated into the analysis.*

- Concern the parties benefiting from the improvements may not be adequately participating in funding the improvements – *Staff noted there will be further negotiations by the BCC as developments come forward.*
- Concern funding sources utilized in the analysis (i.e. gas tax) may be substantially less in the future given the fuel efficiency of future vehicles.

### **Speakers**

**Rae Ann Burton** expressed concerns on the overall plan and widening of Randall Blvd. which benefits new developments and not the existing residents. She requested the widening of Randall Blvd. and construction of the new “S-curve” be removed from the plan.

**Robert Anderson** expressed concern on the potential lack of return on investment of the projects and requested the “S curve” be removed from the plan.

**Nicole Johnson, Conservancy of Southwest Florida** noted the proposed amendments are premature given they are based on potential developments. She recommended the amendments not be adopted and the items be addressed during the 2045 LRTP.

**Charlotte Nycklemoe, League of Women Voters** noted that the proposal is premature and the items should be addressed in 2045 LRTP. Portions of the roads are internal to proposed developments with no significant benefit to residents of County or City of Naples who will be paying for the improvements. She will provide written comment to the Board their suggestions.

**Pat Utter, Collier Enterprises** noted the proposals define projections and needs for future growth, not approvals for development specific to Rural Lands West. The projects added have been planned for a long time and should remain in the proposed plan. RLW will be mitigating any impacts for the roads in their development, not the County.

**Ms. McLaughlin** reported the MPO has an obligation to plan for future growth and Staff recommends the proposed amendments be adopted.

***Commissioner Saunders moved to adopt the 2040 LRTP Amendment Adoption Report including recommendations for the Needs Plan and the Cost Feasible Plan. Second by Commissioner Solis.***

During Board discussions, the following was noted:

- The document is a long range planning tool with certain items (e.g. Randall Blvd. S Curve) ultimately being considered by the BOCC at a later. These decisions will be aided by the results of the Randall Blvd./Oil Well Road Corridor study.
- The document may be utilized by governing bodies as a tool in negotiations with those proposing future developments.
- Concerns on the levels of the funding required to implement the plan versus the available revenue sources identified at this point in time.

*Roll Call vote was taken and the motion failed 4 “yes” – 4 “no.” Chairman McDaniel, Commissioner Saunders, Councilman Batte and Commissioner Solis voted “yes.” Vice Mayor Penniman, Councilman Buxton, Councilwoman Middelstaedt and Commissioner Taylor voted “no.”*

Break: 11:07am

Reconvened: 11:25am

**9. Regular Board Action (No Roll Call) - Continued**

**9.A Adopt Policy on Reprogramming Unobligated SU Funds**

**Ms. Otero** presented the Executive Summary “*Adopt Policy on Reprogramming Unobligated SU Funds*” for consideration. Staff recommends approval of the Resolution.

*Commissioner Saunders moved to approve Resolution 2018-02, establishing policy on the use and reprogramming of available Surface Transportation-Urban Funds to cover cost over-runs on Local Agency and FDOT managed projects. Second by Councilman Buxton. Motion carried 6 “yes” – 1 “no.” Vice Mayor Penniman voted “no.”*

**9.B Approve the FY 2018/19-2019/20 Unified Planning Work Program (UPWP) and MPO Agreement**

**Ms. Otero** presented the Executive Summary “*Approve the FY 2018/19-2019/20 Unified Planning Work Program (UPWP) and MPO Agreement*” for consideration. She requested the Board approve the FY 2018/19- 2019/20 UPWP, the MPO Agreement and the attached Resolution.

*Commissioner Solis moved to approve the FY 2018/19- 2019/20 UPWP, the MPO Agreement and associated Resolution. Second by Vice Mayor Penniman. Carried unanimously 7 – 0.*

**9.D Adopt Updated Project Priorities for 2018**

**Ms. McLaughlin** presented the Executive Summary “*Adopt Updated Project Priorities for 2018*” for consideration. She requested the Board adopt the attached updated project priorities for 2018 and noted the focus is on the first two priorities (bridge construction for 16th Street NE, south of 10th Ave NE - \$8,000,000 and PD&E for bridge at 47th Avenue NE, west of Everglades Boulevard).

*Councilwoman Penniman moved to adopt the updated project priorities for 2018 as presented by Staff. Second by Councilman Buxton. Carried unanimously 7 – 0.*

**10. Presentations (May Require Board Action)**

**10.A Review of Draft Golden Gate City Walkable Community Study**

Staff presented the Executive Summary “*Review of Draft Golden Gate City Walkable Community Study*” for information purposes.

**Katie Habgood, Jacobs Engineering** presented the PowerPoint “*Golden Gate City Walkable Community Study Draft Collier MPO Board May 11, 2018*” for information purposes highlighting:

- The study was completed via data analysis of the existing conditions and extensive public & stakeholder outreach efforts.

- The scoring priorities included the proximity to schools, transit stops and uses by pedestrian or bicyclist (weighted most heavily).
- The findings concluded the area is at an “E” level service and the draft recommendations include focusing on infrastructure gaps, exploring other projects and programs and not to “be afraid to try something that hasn’t been done before.”
- Other concepts include implementing measures such as early school release for walkers and bikers, painted intersections, roundabouts, wider walkways to schools, shade tree planting projects, etc.
- The next steps include collecting comments and recommendations from Committees and others with adoption of the plan by the BOCC slated for June of 2018.

*Commissioner Taylor returned at 11:50am.*

### **10.B Update on Bicycle and Pedestrian Master Plan**

**Mr. Ortman** presented the Executive Summary “*Update on Bicycle & Pedestrian Master Plan*” for information purposes and PowerPoint “*Board Update May 11, 2018*” highlighting:

- The plan is being developed via input from the public and various stakeholder groups in order to address safety, connectivity concerns, changes to local roads and use of multi purpose paths and greenways.
- The needs assessment included data analysis for bike crashes.
- Proposed policy concepts include implementing regulations and design requirements for connections between developments and the bike/ped network; interconnections between developments and bicycle parking; improved roadway designs including 6 ft sidewalk one side, 10-12’ trail other side, consistent transition of begin/end of bike lanes; wider shoulders on high speed roadways; pedestrian crossing opportunities; signalized trail/roadway crossings – signalized, considering use of buffered bicycle lanes before standard bike lanes on all resurfacing and capacity projects, etc.
- The next steps include refining needs, prioritizing criteria, developing planning level costs, identifying funding sources, etc.

### **11. Member Comments**

**Commissioner Taylor** requested Staff clarify a timeline concern brought to her attention on the proposed amendments to the Long Range Transportation Plan.

**Ms. Scott** reported that on after May 27, 2018, any amendments to the Long Range Transportation Plan must conform to the new requirements from the Federal Highway Administration and FDOT which address new performance measures, targets, etc. Staff is prepared to develop the 2045 plan under the new requirements but is unsure on the ramifications of proposing changes to existing plans.

Board discussion occurred on the feasibility of reconsidering the previous motion.

**Scott Teach, Deputy County Attorney**, notified the Board the County’s policy for reconsideration requires a party who spoke on an item be allowed to provide further comment on a reconsideration and expressed concern those members of the public have left the meeting. He recommended the item be considered at a future meeting.



*Commissioner Taylor moved for the MPO Board to schedule another meeting within the required timeframe to discuss the proposed amendments to the 2040 Long Range Transportation Plan. Second by Chairman McDaniel. Motion carried 7 “yes” 1 “no.” Councilwoman Penniman voted “no.”*

**12. Distribution Items**

**12.A Naples City Manager Response for Co-location Study**

Staff presented the Executive Summary “*Naples City Manager Response for Co-location Study*” for consideration. They received a letter dated April 26, 2018 from Bill Moss, Naples City Manager regarding the FDOT’s report on the Traffic Management Center Co-location Feasibility Study outlining the City’s desire to maintain the existing facility in the City.

*Commissioner Saunders moved to remove the Item from the Board’s future Agendas. Second by Chairman McDaniel. Carried unanimously 8 – 0.*

**14. Next Meeting Date**

**A. Regular Meeting – June 8, 2018 – 9:00 a.m. Board of County Commissioners Chambers**

**15. Adjourn**

*With no further comments Chairman McDaniel adjourned the meeting at approximately 12:18p.m.*